EXPLORATORY STUDY ON THE IBERIAN UNION IN SECONDARY TEXTBOOKS OF PORTUGAL AND SPAIN: STUDENTS' IDEAS ABOUT THIS HISTORICAL PROCESS FROM THEIR USE

Glória Solé (CIEd, University of Minho, Portugal)
gsole@ie.uminho.pt

Cosme Gómez (DICSO, University of Múrcia, Spain)
cjgomez@um.es
This exploratory study is part of Research project EDU2015-65621-C3-2-R "The evaluation of competences and the development of cognitive abilities on history in Compulsory Secondary Education“.

• Comparative analysis of curriculum, History textbooks, historical learning.
• Perception on the evaluation of historical competences by students.
• Analysis of historical narratives.
INTRODUCTION

This issue (Iberian Union) is common to both countries (Portugal and Spain). Iberian Union is the historical period that goes from 1580 to 1640 in which Portugal was governed by the kings of Spain (Philip I, Philip II and Philip II- a king for two countries), giving rise to the Philippine dynasty in Portugal.

Mains goals:
Understand how this historical process is covered in textbooks in Portugal and Spain, and how these influence the historical ideas of Portuguese and Spanish students.

As the students think the possibility of not having been given the Restoration of Independence (separation of the two crowns in 1640, Spain and Portugal) as would be the History of Portugal and Spain today (counterfactual).
Usually textbooks play a transmitting function of knowledge and sense of hegemonic reality by the authorities or power. Foster (2011) suggests it is a powerful cultural artifact that contains ideas and values that influential sectors society expect that students learn.

Is key to analyze the construction of that narrative in the approach proposed by Chartier (2007), but remembering authors as Apple & Christian-Smith, 1991; Paxton, 1999; or Porat, 2004. They indicate that the content shown by the textbooks are not literally reproduced by teachers or students without processing with his previous knowledge of the subject (Létourneau, 2014; Pla, 2012).

George Eckert Institute is a reference for the large library and mobilizing funds of international projects.

• How the historical process of the Iberian Union is constructed in textbooks in Portugal and Spain?

• What ideas do students construct about the concept of Iberian Union based on textbooks?

• How do students interpret the textbook sources (about this historical process)?

• What consequences of Union Iberian do students envisage for Portugal and Spain if the independence of the restoration had not taken place in 1640?
First step- Analysis of the textbooks

The sample- 3 Portuguese textbooks

3 Spain textbooks

Data analysis- Content Analysis (Bardin, 2004); Inductive analysis (inspired by Grounded Theory, Corbin & Strauss, 2008).
**METHODOLOGY**

The **empirical study**- study of an essentially qualitative nature (with an additional quantitative approach).

The **sample**- 22 students (9 girls and 13 boys, 13-14 year olders) attending 8th grade) in a Portuguese urban school.

**Instrument**- individual questionnaire (paper and pencil task).

**Data analysis**- Inductive analysis (inspired by Grounded Theory, Corbin & Strauss, 2008).
How the historical process of the Iberian Union is constructed in textbooks in Portugal and Spain?

Portugal

- Iberian Union appears in the theme of Union of peninsular empires and restoration of independence.

- Succession problem - dynastic crisis (Death of the king d. Sebastião (young) and King Cardinal D. Henrique).

- Various candidates- (genealogy).

- Support for Philip II of Spain by the nobility and clergy (Iberian Union-1581).

- The successors of Philip II did not fulfill the sworn promises in the court of Tomar (taxes, military service, War of 30 years, political office delivered the Spanish, did not defend our conquests from other empires ... financial and political crisis).

- 1640 - Portuguese revolt and acclamation of King João IV of Portugal (Restoration of Independence).
O apogeu do Império Espanhol

Neoragna metade do século XVII, a Espanha já se tinha transformado na maior potência colonial europeia. A sua prosperidade assentava nos grandes rendimentos de ouro e prata que chegavam a Sevilha, provenientes da América.

Em 1556, vulto ao trono de Espanha Filipe II, que herdou um extenso império, composto por possessões na Europa e por domínios ultramarinos (mapa da pg. 35). O seu império incluía todos os territórios espanhóis e principados controlados por poderosos aliados, que facilitavam e transportavam os valiosos mercadorias. Depois de 1530, a Espanha possuía três territórios na América e suas colônias ultramarinas. Vou buscar como liso aconteceu.

A união ibérica

Quando D. Sebastião assumiu o poder, em 1564, Portugal já se balançava sob um grave crise económica. Sem experiência governamental, a pavor com a glória de consolidar no mundo marítimo e empenhar-se em colonizar, os camponeses de conquistas na Terra do Algarve, mas encontrava resistência. Quanto todos os que participaram nesse esforço acabaram por morte, incluindo o próprio rei.

Sem sucessores direitos, a morte de D. Sebastião mergulhou Portugal num grave crise política. Durante dois anos a monarquia estendeu-se no catedral D. Henrique, bispo de D. Sebastião, já com muita idade e doença. Quando o cardápio mostrou o problema de sucessão ao trono continuou por resolver e sem solução pacífica a vista. Os principais candidatos eram todos netos do D. Manuel:

- E. Catário, despeça de Bragança, que, apesar de todas as tentativas jurídicas que realizou para fazer valer a sua posição, não invejava apenas sucessores;
- A. Antíneo, príncipe do Crato, filho ilegítimo do infante D. Luis, foi agradiado principalmente pelo povo, que o chegou a ralar no Santarém;
- Filipe II de Espanha apoiado pela nobreza e pela burguesia, apoiada pela poderiosidade de viver e obter novos cargos e aumentar os seus lucros ao participarem nos negócios de sucesso no Império Espanhol.

Em 1580 Filipe II invadiu Portugal e encontrou grande resistência. Foi aclamado rei nas Cortes de Tomar, onde se comprometeu a manter a autonomia do país e a respeitar os seus costumes, mas abandonou a fala, mudando-se para a portuguesa. Filipe II hospedou a sua palácio, cumprindo as promessas que fez, o que não aconteceu, mais tarde, com os seus sucessores.

Batalha de Alcácer Quibir.
How the historical process of the Iberian Union is constructed in textbooks in Portugal and Spain?

Spain

• Iberian Union appears in the theme of the Iberian Monarchy.

• Politics of Catholic Kings: external politics- agreements and political alliances through marriage (D. Manuel marriage with Isabel the Aragón and Maria the Aragón. (source genealogy); Philip II inherited the Portuguese crown.

• The Hispanic monarchy (Carlos V; Philip II; III and IV).

• In 1580 the king of Portugal died without heirs. Annexation of Portugal. Philip II claims the right to the crown as the son of Isabel of Portugal.

• Internal Problems- Wars, Bankruptcy and internal wear - War of 30 years; union of arms (1626- all the kingdoms of the Spanish monarchy had to contribute to the wars in Europe).

• Rebellions- Appointment of a King in Portugal.
• Defense of the Iberian Monarchy against other powers (Holland, France and England).
La Monarquía Hispánica de Felipe II

Felipe II, cuyo reinado extendió desde 1556 y 1598, heredó de su padre Carlos, los territorios de la casa de Borbón y las corones de Aragón y Castilla, con sus posesiones en Europa y América. Con la incorporación del reino de Portugal y sus dominios en todo el mundo, se convertía en el primer imperio mundial, con territorios en todos los continentes.

A pesar de su gran extensión, se puede hablar de la Monarquía hispánica, ya que Felipe II gobernó desde la península ibérica, creando nuevos centros de poder en Madrid y San Lázaro del Escorial, y apoyándose básicamente en la corona de Castilla.

El gobierno interior de Felipe II

Felipe II pretendía la política que se venía desarrollando desde los reyes Católicos, y que se basaba en el crecimiento del poder del monarca y en la defensa del catolicismo.

Para conseguir estos objetivos, Felipe desarrolló una burocracia más sólida y un sistema de derechos que se apoyaba en los reyes, y en la creación de nuevos centros de poder en la corona de Castilla.

El gobierno exterior de Felipe II

Felipe II pretendía la paz en los territorios de los Imperios y en el bacán del catolicismo.

Para conseguir este objetivo, Felipe desarrolló una burocracia más sólida y un sistema de derechos que se apoyaba en los reyes, y en la creación de nuevos centros de poder en la corona de Castilla.

La revuelta de los moriscos en los Alpujarras (1609)

La revuelta de los moriscos fue una de las revueltas más importantes de la historia de España. Se produjo en las Alpujarras, una región con una alta concentración de población musulmana, que había sido forzada a convertirse al cristianismo.

La revuelta fue liderada por Juan de Austria, hermano del rey, y en su momento fue sofocada por las fuerzas del monarca.

La revuelta de los aragoneses (1712)

La revuelta de los aragoneses fue una de las revueltas más importantes de la historia de España. Se produjo en el norte de Aragón, donde el poder del monarca era relativamente débil.

La revuelta fue liderada por los aragoneses, que se rebelaron contra el monarca.

La revuelta de los Parísinos (1688)

La revuelta de los Parísinos fue una de las revueltas más importantes de la historia de España. Se produjo en París, donde el poder del monarca era relativamente débil.

La revuelta fue liderada por los parísinos, que se rebelaron contra el monarca.

La revuelta de los castellanos (1690)

La revuelta de los castellanos fue una de las revueltas más importantes de la historia de España. Se produjo en Castilla, donde el poder del monarca era relativamente débil.

La revuelta fue liderada por los castellanos, que se rebelaron contra el monarca.

La revuelta de los catalanes (1712)

La revuelta de los catalanes fue una de las revueltas más importantes de la historia de España. Se produjo en Cataluña, donde el poder del monarca era relativamente débil.

La revuelta fue liderada por los catalanes, que se rebelaron contra el monarca.

La revuelta de los andaluces (1712)

La revuelta de los andaluces fue una de las revueltas más importantes de la historia de España. Se produjo en Andalucía, donde el poder del monarca era relativamente débil.

La revuelta fue liderada por los andaluces, que se rebelaron contra el monarca.

La revuelta de los aragoneses (1712)

La revuelta de los aragoneses fue una de las revueltas más importantes de la historia de España. Se produjo en el norte de Aragón, donde el poder del monarca era relativamente débil.

La revuelta fue liderada por los aragoneses, que se rebelaron contra el monarca.
The students were asked about the meaning of Iberian Union and its possible consequences for Portugal and Spain if it had not happened the independence of the Restoration in 1640, using the interpretation their textbooks sources. Examples:

1- What do you know about what was the Iberian Union from the history lesson?
2 - Observe your textbook historical sources 1 and 2:
   2.1- What events led to the Iberian Union?
3 - Observe your textbook historical sources 3 and 4:
   3.1- What will have led to the Restoration of the Independence of Portugal?

4- If the Restoration of Independence had not happened in Portugal what do you think would be different and what would remain in the History of Portugal and Spain? (a hypothetical question about the past).

5. Imagine that you had to tell a foreigner what the Philip Domain in Portugal was, what would you tell him?
Source 1- Candidates for the Portuguese throne in 1580

Source 2- Chronology - Dynastic Union and the Restoration

Source 3- The Philip Domain

Source 4- The battles of the Restoration War

1- What do you know about what was the Iberian Union from the history lesson?

Table 1- Students' ideas on the concept of Iberian Union

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Descriptors</th>
<th>Example- Students' responses</th>
<th>Number of occurrences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alternative answer</td>
<td>Answers that express alternative ideas to the substantive concept.</td>
<td>The Iberian Union is Portugal and Spain together separated by the Pyrenees. (A5)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subjectivized answer</td>
<td>Answers that simply repeat the concept of union between Portugal and Spain.</td>
<td>What I know about the Iberian Union was that Spain wanted to stay with Portugal, so they could stay with Portugal, which would be bad. (A4)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tautological answer</td>
<td>Answers that simply repeat the concept of union between Portugal and Spain.</td>
<td>The Iberian Union was the union between Portugal and Spain. (A7)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approximate answer</td>
<td>Answers that point to an approximate substantive knowledge of the substantive concept.</td>
<td>The Iberian Union was the Union between the kingdoms of Portugal and Castile in which we were ruled for 60 years by Spanish kings. (A19)</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contextualized answer</td>
<td>Answers that explain and contextualize the historical process.</td>
<td>After the crisis of Succession due to the death of D. Sebastião Portugal began to be governed by the Spanish kings. The Spanish kings did not conform to what they had said when D. Philip I was elected. That is why the Portuguese revolted and there were some wars. After the wars they wrote a peace treaty that they call the Iberian Union. (A6).</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No answer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**DATA ANALYSIS**

2-What events led to the Iberian Union?

Table 2- Students' ideas on causality of the historical process of Iberian Union

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Descriptors</th>
<th>Example- Students' responses</th>
<th>Number of occurrences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alternative</td>
<td>Confuse causes with consequences.</td>
<td>The Spanish army invades Portugal and defeats the troops of the Prior of the Crato, Restoration of the independence, Peace with Castle. (A5)</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single event</td>
<td>Focus on the crisis Dynastic with the death of D. Sebastião.</td>
<td>The events are the crisis of succession (A14)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two or more events</td>
<td>Ex. Dynastic Crisis and support of the nobility and the Clergy to the Iberian Union.</td>
<td>What led to the Iberian Union was, first the death of D. Sebastião, the invasions of the Spanish armies and later the death of the king, Cardinal D.Henrique. (A3)</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contextualized Causality</td>
<td>Multiple interconnected events.</td>
<td>The death of D. Sebastião led to a dynastic crisis between D. Filipe II, D. António Prior do Crato and D. Catarina. Who won was D. Philip II having thus united Portugal to Spain. (A22)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No answer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3 - Students’ ideas on causality of the historical process of Portugal's Independence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Descriptors</th>
<th>Example - Students’ responses</th>
<th>Number of occurrences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single event</td>
<td>They just indicate a cause.</td>
<td>What has led to the Restoration of the Independence of Portugal was the discontent of the Portuguese with the actions of the Philips of Spain. (A14)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Causality based on mere reproduction of information</td>
<td>They list various causes by simply stating them without any explanation or simply copying the information from the documents.</td>
<td>King Philip IV did not come to the defense and recovery of our conquests, he afflicted and vexed peoples with unbearable tributes, spent common incomes in foreign wars, sold for money the offices of justice and the Treasury, and provided for unworthy and incapable persons. (A9)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contextualized Causality</td>
<td>They contextualize some of the causes by relating and explaining them.</td>
<td>IT was the unfulfilled promises of the Spanish kings, important posts of Portugal were handed over to Spanish, increased taxes. (A3)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Causality multiperspetividad</td>
<td>Causality of multiperspectivity</td>
<td>The Restoration of Independence happened, the people were unhappy because they were being nominated Spanish instead of Portuguese for the most important positions. Spain was having more benefits and the monarch was spending the Portuguese money. (A10)</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No answer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. If the Restoration of Independence had not happened in Portugal what do you think would be different in the History of Portugal and Spain?

**Table 4 - Substantive concepts presented by Portuguese students**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Portugal and Spain would continue their conflicts.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Portuguese would react and resist regardless of the restoration of 1640.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The countries would be together, they would be one country.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It was still a monarchy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portuguese wealth and colonies would be from Spain.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loss of cultural identity (language, customs, traditions, etc.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. If the Restoration of Independence had not happened in Portugal what do you think would be different in the History of Portugal and Spain?

Table 5 - Metahistorical ideas suggested in substantive answers-contourfactual exercise

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Descriptors</th>
<th>N.º</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fixed past- absence of alternative scenarios</td>
<td>Students indicate the restoration of independence as certain regardless of when it will have taken place. Like something that would inevitably happen. Projecting the idea of resistance.</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternative scenarios - one country</td>
<td>Students integrate Portugal into the Kingdom of Spain as a possible scenario of the formation of a single country.</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternative scenarios - changes at the political level</td>
<td>Student’s present alternative scenarios at the political level, recognizing that it might be possible to be a single country today, but they have political consequences and express negative ideas for this scenario associated with the usurpation of territory and wealth on the part of the Spanish.</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternative scenarios - cultural and identity changes</td>
<td>The students present alternative scenarios, recognizing that it might be possible to be a single country today, but they express ideas of loss of identity (culture, language, traditions).</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Imagine you had to tell a stranger what was the Philip Domain in Portugal, what would you say to him? **Table 6 - Metahistorical ideas suggested in historical narratives (Rüssen, 2012)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Descriptors</th>
<th>Example- Students’ narratives</th>
<th>N=</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traditional Narrative</td>
<td>Narratives that value traditions, origins as indispensable elements in the orientation of practical life. A static view of history emerges, of traditional legitimization of what was the Philippine Domain.</td>
<td>The Philip Domain was the period when Portugal was dominated by the kings Philip II, Philip III and Philip IV of Spain. (A1)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exemplary Narrative</td>
<td>Narratives as a reminder of the past, which gives us lessons for the present. That point to an approximate substantive knowledge of the substantive concept, integrating the multiplicity of external actions.</td>
<td>The Philip Domain happened on the death of and D. Sebastião who had no children. As there was no king invaded Portugal and then remained as a single country. After 3 Philip kings passed and they did not obey what King D. Philip I said the Portuguese managed to win in the restoration of Independence. (A20)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical Narrative</td>
<td>Narratives that integrate opinions. The notion of rupture in continuity prevails, presenting contradictory experiences of the past.</td>
<td>That Spain wanted to stay with Portugal to keep the expenses of the war and that it would be bad for us. (A4)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genetic Narrative</td>
<td>Narratives that explain and contextualize the historical process. In this narrative structure, the change that occurs after the restoration of independence emerges as rupture, with a dynamic view of time.</td>
<td>I would say that the Philip Domain in Portugal was that, our king died, we were ruled by Philip II of Spain who came to rule Portugal and Spain, he had promised several things but throughout the third Philippine reign they failed to fulfil the various things promised, and then there was a revolt and has ended the Philip reign. (A7)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No answer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Students use some previous knowledge when answering to question 1.

• Those initial expressions of ideas about the Iberian Union (1 and 5) appear to be enlarged and refined when looking at textbook sources (from generic or tautological ideas to more detailed ones and contextualized).

• Many students confuse causes with consequences relate with the historical process of Iberian Union or list more than two causes by reproducing information from sources.

• Sources interpretation appears too simplistic in many cases (descriptive or just focused in a single idea).
PROVISIONAL REFLECTIONS ON RESULTS

• Concerning past and present relationships students gave counterfactual pictures which pose some perplexities in terms of historical plausibility (question 5).

• A significant number of students do not present alternative scenarios and those who present express ideas of loss at the political and identity level.

• The conceptual categorisation of those answers will be carried on with add of follow-up interviews if possible.

• Although most of the students present a traditional narrative about this historical process there are others that reveal a critical narrative, prevailing the idea of rupture with this traumatic past for the Portuguese.

• The data of the Spanish students could give another vision on the construction of this historical process common to both countries.
THANK YOU!

Glória Solé (Cied, University of Minho, Portugal)
gsole@ie.uminho.pt

Cosme Gómez (University of Múrcia, Spain)
cjgomez@um.es